

### **Contents**

- Paper Summary: Privacy
- Paper Summary: Echo chambers
- Intro metaverse
- Linking metaverse to paper 1
- Linking metaverse to paper 2
- Discussion

# Privacy is Power: Summary Carissa Véliz

The paper argues that we should protect our data & privacy, for the companies who have it can have power over us as an individual and as a society



# Privacy is Power: Why protect your data?

- Data can be used against you now or later
  - You most likely DO have things to hide
  - You are not a nobody, you have
    - Time, attention and money to spend
    - An identity which can be stolen
    - A body to use or test on
    - Connections to other people
    - A vote in politics

# Privacy is Power: Data & Influence

- Your data is worth money because it can be
  - Sold as is
  - Used to predict your behaviour and influence it
  - Used to predict your thoughts and beliefs and influence them
  - Used to find groups in society
- When a company sells data, they do not actually sell data, they sell ways to influence and use you.

# Privacy is Power: Influence & power

Data --> predict behaviour --> influence behaviour Influence = power

#### Types of power:

 Power type 1: "The capacity of A to motivate B to think or do something that B would otherwise not have thought or done."

• Power type 2: idem, but with force or violence.

# Privacy is Power: How to protect yourself

- Do not give data without resistance, limit what companies receive, give limited parts of names
- Obfuscate your data: give false information
- Do not post pictures of other people online
- Use extentions to block adds and cookies
- Turn of wifi, bluetooth or location when not in use
- Force companies to delete your data if you have the means
- Share concerns online to raise awareness.



## Escape the echo chamber c. Thi Nguyen

Different intellectual communities are no longer sharing ba sic fundamental beliefs.

#### Two phenomena:

- 1. Epistemic bubbles: When you don't hear people
- 2. Echo chamber: When you don't trust people and undermine other voices.

#### **Epistemic bubble**

'An information network from which relevant voices have been excluded by omission'

#### Examples:

- Individual's facebook
- Algorithms of google for filtering information



#### **Epistemic bubble**

#### Point of views:

- + Filtering information to prevent overstuffing of information
- Filtering:
  - > Broadness of viewpoints is filtered out
  - > Filtering is out of our control
- Excessive self-confidence

#### How to break epistemic bubbles:

Expose its members to information and arguments that they have missed.

#### **Echo chamber**

'Social structure from which other relevant voices have been actively discredited. '

#### Compared to a cult:

- Ø Member's trust is narrowed on certain inside voices
- Ø Members are alienanted from outside sources
- Ø Outsiders are labeled as malignant and untrustwort hy



#### **Echo chamber**

#### <u>Difference with epistemic bubbles:</u>

- Acces to other sources, but isolated in who they accept as:
  - Authorities
  - Experts
  - Trusted sources.
- Exposure by outside sources reinforces views

#### Being caught in an echo chamber can be caused by:

- Nurture
- momentary lapse of intellectual alertness

#### **Echo chamber**

#### Escaping the echo chamber:

'Members of an echo chamber are not irrational but misinformed about where to place their trust'.

- Descartes: 'You have to start again by assuming nothing and trusting nobody'.
  - Not realistic
- Useful part: Social rebooting, like a newborn
  - Very hard to conduct!
- Something outsiders can do:
  - > Attack the root and restore trust in some outside voices.

Challenge: escaping depends on intervention of another.

## The Metaverse: What is the metaverse?

- Fully realized digital world that does not yet exist (Herrman & Browning, 2021)
- Metaverse tendencies: Fortnite, Animal Crossing
- Mark Zuckerberg: "you can think about this [the metaverse] as an embodied internet that you are inside of rather than just looking at" (Wheeler, 2021)
- Big companies (e.g. Facebook) invest and want you to spend significant time on there (Bryant, 2021)

# **Virtual Reality Metaverse**



# **Augmented Reality Metaverse**





Image Source: https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/United\_States\_Capitol

# The Metaverse: Ethical problem

- Gather even more data (Bryant, 2021)
  - Spend even more time
  - See what you look at not only where you at
  - Account necessary to participate
- No rules or laws (Pryor, 2021)
  - e.g. Intellectual Property
- Forced to participate
  - Only available online
  - Companies cannot stay behind
- Digital inequality
  - When things are only available in the metaverse
  - Not the same experience for everyone

## The Metaverse: Stakeholders

- Problem owner:
  - Users of the Metaverse
    - Could end up in epistemic bubble or echo chamber
      - Value Conflict: Trust
    - Not in control over personal data
      - Value Conflict: Privacy
- Companies have the power
  - Make money
- Companies that advertise
- Government

Ethical problem: (Poel & Royakkers, 2011)

- Different reflections on what is good or bad
- Values at stake

# Linking 'Privacy is Power' to the Metaverse

- You become even less of a nobody
  - Larger part of daily life
  - More detailed identity --> Blockchain (verified identities)
- More explicit data
  - Group forming in Metaverse
  - 3D behavior
- Véliz ways of protecting your privacy
- The sold influence
- Normalization --> The shifting norms of privacy



# Echo Chambers and epistemic bubbles in the Metaverse

The characteristics of the metaverse are still unclear

Key characteristics

Assumptions

# **Epistemic bubbles in the metaverse**

The metaverse will cause epistemic bubbles

- Non-transparent filters on our information that don't deliver sufficiently broad and representative information
- They cause exaggerated amounts of agreement and suppressed levels of disagreement in online encounters





### **Echo chambers in the metaverse**

The metaverse will empower echo chambers

- Echo chambers work by systematically alienating their members from all outside epistemic sources
- Members are isolated by changes in who they accept as authorities

Who should be in control over the metaverse?

Statement: It would be ethical to have companies like Facebook in power, meaning they have power in rule-making in the metaverse as well as power of influencing users enabled by the gathering of data.

Yes

Who should be in control?

If the government has control over the metaverse, how would that influence your view around ethics of power relations in the metaverse?

Who should be in control?

How would the decentralization of the metaverse influence your view on the ethics of power division in the metaverse?

How can consent play a role in the ethics of the Metaverse?

Statement: It is ethical if users can consent to all known consequences of the Metaverse (such as tracking) and then decide to use it.

Yes

How can consent play a role in the ethics of the Metaverse?

To what degree can users comprehend and predict any harms they can be subjected to and consent to?

How should, according to you, the Metaverse be shaped so that it becomes a space that you would want to go to? How could added value outweigh the risks of being influenced to make you consent to these risks?

How free are users to participate in the Metaverse?

Statement: Users are free to choose their participation in the Metaverse

Yes

How free are users to participate in the Metaverse?

What about having services only available on the Metaverse? How free are users then to choose to use the Metaverse?

What about the people that decide not to use the Metaverse?

How blameworthy are users of experiencing echo chamber effects due to the metaverse?

Statement: Users responsible for getting into an echo chamber by the Metaverse

Yes

How should, according to you, the Metaverse be shaped so that it becomes a space that you would want to go to? How could added value outweigh the risks of being influenced?

Is it ethical to make the metaverse a reality or should it be prevented from becoming a reality?

Statement: Making the metaverse a reality is ethical

Yes

### References

- Bryant, M. (2021, September 26). *Is Facebook leading us on a journey to the metaverse?* The Guardian. <a href="https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2021/sep/26/is-facebook-leading-us-on-a-journey-to-the-metaverse">https://www.theguardian.com/technology/2021/sep/26/is-facebook-leading-us-on-a-journey-to-the-metaverse</a>
- Forst, R. (2015). Noumenal power. Journal of Political Philosophy, 23(2), 111-127.
- Herrman, J., & Browning, K. (2021, October 17). What Is the Metaverse? The New York Times. Retrieved October 19, 2021, from https://www.nytimes.com/2021/07/10/style/metaverse-virtual-worlds.html
- Poel, I. R. van de & Royakkers, L. M. M. (2011). *Ethics, technology, and engineering : an introduction*. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Pryor, G. (2021, March 25). *The metaverse: real world laws give rise to virtual world problems*. CityAM. https://www.cityam.com/the-metaverse-real-world-laws-give-rise-to-virtual-world-problems/
- Thi Nguyen, C. (2018) Escape the Echo Chamber, Aeon, https://aeon.co/essays/why-its-as-hard-to-escape-an-echo-chamber-as-it-is-to-flee-a —cult
- Véliz, C. (2019), Privacy is Power, Aeon, https://aeon.co/essays/privacy-matters-because-it -empowers-us-all
- Wheeler, T. (2021, September 30). *The metachallenges of the metaverse*. Brookings. https://www.brookings.edu/blog/techtank/2021/09/30/the-metachallenges-of-the-metaverse/